Pak. J. Bot, 39(6): 2159-2165, 2007.

ANTAGONISTIC ACTIVITY OF BACTERIAL INOCULUM MULTIPLIED ON *RHIZOPHORA MUCRONATA* LAMK., IN THE CONTROL OF ROOT INFECTING FUNGI ON MASH BEAN AND OKRA

MARIUM TARIQ, SHAHNAZ DAWAR, FATIMA S. MEHDI AND M. JAVED ZAKI

Department of Botany, University of Karachi, Karachi-75270, Pakistan.

Abstract

Microbial antagonists viz., *Bacillus subtilis, B. thuringiensis, B. cereus* and *Rhizobium meliloti* multiplied on dry powder of leaves and stem of *R. mucronata* were used in the control of root infecting fungi on mash bean and okra. Good growth of microbial antagonists was observed on all plant parts. Population increased with the increase in time. Highest population of *R. meliloti, B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis* was obtained on stem whereas *B. cereus* on leaves powder of *R. mucronata*. Of the four antagonists used *R. meliloti* showed highest population on *R. mucronata* plant parts.

Germination of seeds, shoot length, shoot weight, root length and root weight in okra and mung bean showed promising results when bacterial antagonists viz., *B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis, B. cereus* and *R. meliloti* after multiplication on mangrove plant parts was used @ 1% w/w. Infection of *R. solani* was significantly inhibited on okra when *R. meliloti* multiplied on leaves powder of *R. mucronata* was used @ 1 % w/w whereas all biocontrol bacteria viz., *B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis B. cereus* and *R. meliloti* completely suppressed the infection of *R. solani* and *M. phaseolina* on mung bean when used after multiplication on leaves and stem powder of *R. mucronata*.

Introduction

Rhizobium spp., the plant growth promoting rhizobacteria have a beneficial effect on plants including biological control of soil borne pathogens, induce systematic resistance to plant pathogen, improvement of nutrient, uptake of plant (Seuk Bae *et al.*, 2000). The genus *Rhizobium* has an ability of nitrogen-fixation in leguminous plants (Hynes & Connel, 1990) and in the control of soil-borne root-infecting fungi both in leguminous and non-leguminous plants (Ehteshamul-Haque & Ghaffar, 1993; Siddiqui *et al.*, 1998a; 1998b). Although most species of *Bacillus* are harmless saprophytes, two species viz., *B. thuringiensis* and *B. cereus* are considered medically significant. *B. thuringiensis* is a plant growth promoting bacterium which produces bacteriocin compounds (Gray *et al.*, 2006). *B. thuringiensis* (commonly known as 'Bt') is an insecticidal bacterium, marketed worldwide for control of many important plant pests, mainly caterpillars of Lepidoptera, mosquito larvae and black flies etc. Application of bacteria either as seed dressing or as soil drenching has shown a significant suppression of root infecting pathogens on leguminous and non- leguminous plants (Zaki & Ghaffar, 1987; Ehtesham-ul-Haque *et al.*, 1990; Shahzad & Ghaffar, 1992).

Mangroves are widespread in tropical and subtropical regions, growing in the saline intertidal zones of sheltered coast lines. Mangrove specie *R. mucronata* comprises less than 5% of the Indus Delta in Pakistan (Saifullah, 1982). The mangrove plant parts are of various uses like bark used for tanning and dye. Leaves are the source of a black or chestnut dye (Burkill, 1966). It is reported that mangrove is a folk remedy for angina, diabetes, diarrhea, dysentery, hematuria and haemorrhage (Duke & Wain, 1981).

Plant diseases causing organisms produce serious losses to crop plants and adversely affect the agricultural economy of a country (Hafeez, 1986). The soil borne root-infecting fungus, *Macrophomina phaseolina* is reported to produces charcoal rot over 500 species of plants (Sinclair, 1982). *Rhizoctonia solani* exists as active mycelium in the soil, attacks over 2000 species of plants (Parmeter, 1970) and *Fusarium* species (Booth, 1971) are known to attack a wide range of host plants in different parts of the world.

The main objective of this study was to examine the efficacy of biocontrol agents viz., *R. meliloti, B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis,* and *B. cereus* multiplied on *R. mucronata* plant parts for the control of root infecting fungi and growth promotion of mash bean and okra.

Materials and Methods

Mangrove plant parts viz., leaves and stem of *Rhizophora mucronata* Lamk., were collected from Sonmiyani. Cultures of different species of *Bacillus* viz., *B. thuringiensis* (Bt-10), *B. cereus* (Bc-20) and *B. subtilis* (Bs-12) were obtained from the Department of Microbiology, University of Karachi whereas *R. meliloti* (R-5) was obtained from the root nodules of leguminous plant like *Melilotus alba*. The cultures were grown on nutrient agar, PDA or Yeast Extract Mannitol Agar medium supplemented with antibiotics and incubated for 1-2 days. Leaves and stem of *R. mucronata* as an organic substrate were used for the growth of bacterial antagonists viz., *B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis, B. cereus* and *R. meliloti*. Different plant parts was air dried and powdered in an electric grinder. For the multiplication of microbial antagonists 100 gm of each part powder was transferred in polyethylene bag. The bag was sealed and then sterilized in an autoclaved at 15 psi. The substrates in polyethylene bags were inoculated by injecting with a syringe a cell suspension of biocontrol agents @ 2 ml/100 g plant parts. The inoculated substrates were stored at room temperature for growth.

Population of bacterial antagonists was determined by using soil dilution plate method (Waksman & Fred, 1922) with slight modification. After making dilutions, one ml suspension was poured on Yeast Extract Mannitol Agar medium and incubated at 28°C for 2-4 days. Bacterial colonies growing on plates were counted and multiplied by the dilution factor which gave cfu/ml of bacteria. Colony forming unit/seed was calculated by taking ten seeds after treatment with suspension of microbial antagonists transferred in test tube containing 10 ml sterilized distilled water. The test tube was shaken and dilution series was made. One ml suspension was poured on PDA and YMA respectively for fungi and bacteria.

Seeds of okra and mung bean were surface sterilized with 1 % Ca(OCl)₂ for 3 min., rinsed thoroughly in running tap water and dried aseptically. Five surface disinfested seeds were treated with bacterial cultures using 1% gum Arabic. For soil drenching a 25 ml aqueous cell suspension of 5 day old bacterial strains were drenched in 8 cm diam., plastic pots, each containing 300 g soil. Treatments were replicated three times. Okra and mung bean seeds were used as test plants. Five treated seeds were sown in 8 cm diam., plastic pots, each containing 300 g soil. Seeds treated with sterile distilled water served as control. The soil used was sandy loam (Sand, Silt, Clay; 70, 19,11% respectively), pH ranged from 7.5-8.1 with moisture holding capacity (MHC) of 40% (Keen & Raczkowski, 1922), total nitrogen 0.077-0.099% (Mackenzie & Wallace, 1954), total organic matter 4.17-4.59%. Soil had natural infestation of 4-6 sclerotia/g soil of *Macrophomina phaseolina* as estimated by wet sieving dilution technique (Sheikh & Ghaffar, 1975); 3-5% colonization of *Rhizoctonia solani* on sorghum seeds used as baits (Wilhelm, 1955) and $8x10^6$ cfu/g soil of *Fusarium* sp, as assessed by soil dilution technique (Nash & Snyder, 1962). Treatments were replicated three times.

2160

Substrates		Tin	ne interval (da	iys)	
Substrates	0	7	14	21	28
		Rŀ	hizobium melil	oti	
R. mucronata leaves	$17.3 \text{ x} 10^6$	$30.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	35.6 x10 ⁸	$42.7 \text{ x} 10^8$	31.2×10^8
R. mucronata stem	$20.4 \text{ x} 10^6$	$31.3 \text{ x} 10^8$	$36.4 \text{ x} 10^8$	44.6 x10 ⁸	$30.1 \text{ x} 10^8$
		Bac	illus thuringie	nsis	
R. mucronata leaves	$15.2 \text{ x} 10^6$	$23.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	$26.5 \text{ x} 10^8$	$31.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	$17.2 \text{ x} 10^8$
R. mucronata stem	17.6 x10 ⁶	$24.7 \text{ x} 10^8$	$32.1 \text{ x} 10^8$	$40.1 \text{ x} 10^8$	$28.3 \text{ x} 10^8$
		1	Bacillus subtili	<i>S</i>	
R. mucronata leaves	$16.4 \text{ x} 10^6$	$24.4 \text{ x} 10^8$	$28.9 \text{ x} 10^8$	$30.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	$21.1 \text{ x} 10^8$
R. mucronata stem	$21.3 \text{ x} 10^6$	$28.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	$31.6 \text{ x} 10^8$	38.2×10^8	$28.9 ext{ x10}^8$
		i	Bacillus cereus	5	
R. mucronata leaves	$14.2 \text{ x} 10^6$	$22.1 \text{ x} 10^8$	$27.3 \text{ x} 10^8$	$31.7 \text{ x} 10^8$	$25.3 \text{ x} 10^8$
R. mucronata stem	$14.3 \text{ x} 10^6$	19.7 x10 ⁸	$21.6 \text{ x} 10^8$	$28.2 \text{ x} 10^8$	$16.2 \text{ x} 10^8$

 Table 1. Population of *Bacillus* spp., and *Rhizobium meliloti* multiplied on different plant parts of *Rhizophora mucronata* at different time interval.

Plants were uprooted after 30 days of emergence and growth parameters in terms of shoot length, shoot weight, root length and root weight were recorded. Roots were washed in running tap water and then cut five, 1 cm root pieces surface sterilized in 1% Ca(OCl)₂ for 3 min, were transferred on PDA plates containing penicillin @ 100,000/litre and streptomycin @ 20mg/l. Petri dishes were incubated for 5 days at $28\pm2^{\circ}$ C and after one week, infection of roots by fungi was recorded.

Data were analyzed and were subjected to analysis of variance (ANOVA) or factorial analysis of variance (FANOVA) depending upon the experimental design. According to Gomez & Gomez (1984), the follow up of FANOVA included least significant difference (LSD).

Results and Discussion

Good growth of *Bacillus* spp., viz., *B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis B. cereus* and *R. meliloti* on different plant parts viz., leaves and stem *R. mucronata* was observed. Population increased with the increase in time. Highest population of *R. meliloti, B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis* were obtained on stem of *R. mucronata* whereas *B. cereus* on leaves powder of *R. mucronata*. Of the 4 antagonists used *R. meliloti* showed highest population on *R. mucronata* plant parts (Table 1).

The seeds of mung bean were coated with *R. meliloti* @ 73.88 x 10^8 cells /seed and *Bacillus* spp viz; *B. subtilis* @ 84.54 x 10^8 cells /seed, *B. thuringiensis* @ 72.43 x 10^8 cells /seed and *B. cereus* @ 63.02 x 10^8 cells /seed whereas okra seeds were coated with *R. meliloti* @ 86.33 x 10^8 cells /seed, *B. subtilis* @ 105×10^8 cells /seed, *B. thuringiensis* @ 93.68 x 10^8 cells /seed and *B. cereus* @ 88.43 x 10^8 cells /seed. Maximum germination of mung bean seeds was observed where *B. thuringiensis* inoculum multiplied on leaves and stem powder of *R. mucronata* was used. Shoot length was significantly increased in okra where *R. meliloti* and *B. thuringiensis* after multiplication on *R. mucronata* stem powder was used @ 1 % w/w. Shoot weight, root length and weight were significantly increased in mung bean when *R. meliloti*, *B. cereus* and *B. subtilis* inoculum used on *R. mucronata* leaves and stem powder (p<0.001) was used. Seed dressing significantly increased growth parameters of okra and mung bean in all biocontrol bacteria viz., *B. subtilis*, *B. thuringiensis B. cereus* and *R. meliloti* (p<0.001) (Table 2).

		N	Mung bean					Okra		
Treatments	Germination %	Shoot length (cm)	Shoot weight (g)	Root le ngth (cm)	Root weight (g)	Germination %	Shoot length (cm)	Shoot weight (g)	Root length (cm)	Root weight (g)
Control	66.66	19.46	0.30	3.88	0.026	60.00	15.45	0.25	3.78	0.023
R. meliloti (soil drenching)	66.66	20.72	0.32	4.64	0.033	66.66	17.19	0.27	4.52	0.025
R. meliloti (seed dressing)	80.00	21.23	0.36	5.15	0.036	73.33	19.62	0.29	4.56	0.025
R. mucronata leaves powder alone	100.00	23.91	0.5	5.18	0.058	86.66	21.05	0.31	5.64	0.026
R. meliloti inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	93.33	24.96	0.53	6.63	0.066	80.00	21.47	0.36	5.80	0.034
B. thuringiensis (soil drenching)	66.66	19.67	0.37	4.11	0.038	73.33	18.65	0.28	4.15	0.023
B. thuringiensis (soil dressing)	80.00	21.19	0.43	4.78	0.043	73.33	20.11	0.29	4.19	0.024
B. thuringiensis inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	100.00	24.6	0.53	5.49	0.677	93.33	22.08	0.38	5.83	0.036
B. subtilis (soil drenching)	80.00	22.18	0.34	4.42	0.055	80.00	20.58	0.28	4.08	0.023
B. subtilis (seed dressing)	80.00	21.66	0.39	4.95	0.056	73.33	20.77	0.30	4.88	0.026
B. subtilis inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	93.33	24.29	0.55	5.38	0.099	86.66	21.94	0.50	5.68	0.038
B. cereus (soil drenching)	80.00	20.55	0.44	4.64	0.044	66.66	19.05	0.28	4.32	0.023
B. cereus (seed dressing)	86.66	21.14	0.43	5.11	0.047	66.66	20.11	0.26	4.94	0.026
B. cereus inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	93.33	23.97	0.50	6.63	0.068	93.33	22.77	0.45	5.77	0.037
R. mucronata stem powder alone	80.00	23.68	0.54	5.08	0.077	86.66	22.36	0.51	5.44	0.035
R. meliloti inoculum on R. mucronata stem	80.00	23.71	0.57	5.32	0.076	86.66	25.55	0.56	5.77	0.038
B. thuringiensis inoculum on R. mucronata stem	100.00	25.53	0.58	5.50	0.086	93.33	26.88	0.54	5.68	0.035
B. subtilis inoculum on R. mucronata stem	80.00	23.59	0.68	5.83	0.084	86.66	22.42	0.58	5.60	0.035
B. cereus inoculum on R. mucronata stem	86.66	23.83	0.61	6.15	0.081	80.00	22.83	0.53	5.47	0.037
LSD0.05=	30.67	2.987	0.16	2.03	0.03	36.68	5.86	0.33	2.72	0.05

Table 2. Effect of R. meliloti, B. thuringiensis, B. subtilis and B. cereus variotii multiplied on different parts of Rhizophora

2162

MARIUM TARIQ ET AL.,

		Mung bean			Okra	
Treatments	Fusarium spp.,	Rhizoctonia solani	Macrophomina phaseolina	Fusarium spp.,	Rhizoctonia solani	Macrophomina phaseolina
Control	100.00	95.55	100	91.10	100	93.33
R. meliloti (soil drenching)	86.66	93.33	91.10	75.55	82.22	82.22
R. meliloti (seed dressing)	73.33	84.44	73.33	46.66	64.44	75.55
R. mucronata leaves powder alone	4.44	11.11	2.22	19.99	15.55	13.33
R. meliloti inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	4.44	0	0	6.66	0	8.88
B. thuringiensis (soil drenching)	88.88	91.10	91.11	99.99	60	79.99
B. thuringiensis (soil dressing)	62.22	57.77	62.22	31.11	48.88	66.66
B. thuringiensis inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	2.22	4.44	6.66	6.66	4.44	2.22
B. subtilis (soil drenching)	71.10	84.44	95.55	<i>TT.TT</i>	75.55	79.99
B. subtilis (seed dressing)	66.66	73.33	62.22	48.88	68.88	44.44
B. subtilis inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	2.22	4.44	0	11.11	6.66	11.11
B. cereus (soil drenching)	77.77	68.88	55.55	64.44	71.10	62.22
B. cereus (seed dressing)	31.10	33.33	42.22	53.33	42.22	66.66
B. cereus inoculum on R. mucronata leaves	4.44	8.88	0	8.88	4.44	11.10
R. mucronata stem powder alone	8.88	6.66	11.10	70.77	11.10	13.33
R. meliloti inoculum on R. mucronata stem	99.9	0	8.88	6.66	2.22	4.44
B. thuringiensis inoculum on R. mucronata stem	2.22	0	0	4.44	4.44	2.22
B. subtilis inoculum on R. mucronata stem	4.44	6.66	6.66	4.44	8.88	4.44
B. cereus inoculum on R. mucronata stem	8.88	6.66	2.22	8.88	6.66	2.22
LSD0.05=	19.59	22.53	34.28	29.54	29.16	28.89

Infection of R. solani on okra was significantly inhibited by R. meliloti inoculum multiplied on R. mucronata leaves powder used @ 1%w/w whereas all biocontrol bacteria viz., B. subtilis, B. thuringiensis B. cereus and R. meliloti after multiplication on leaves and stem powder of R. mucronata showed complete suppression of R. solani and *M. phaseolina* on mung bean (p < 0.001) (Table 3). Infection of *Fusarium* spp., was significantly reduced (p<0.001) in mung bean and okra where B. subtilis inoculated on leaves and B. thuringiensis inoculum on stem was used @ 1 % w/w (Table 3). Due to the cost of chemicals and their hazardous effect, use of microorganism in the control of root rot fungi is another alternate method (Lumsden & Locke, 1989). Several bacteria have received considerable attention in the control of soil borne root infecting fungi. In the present study shoot weight, root length and weight were significantly increased in mung bean when R. meliloti, B. cereus and B. subtilis used after multiplication on R. mucronata leaves and stem powder @ 1 % w/w. Similar report was made by Dawar et al., (2005) on mung bean and Siddiqui et al., (2000) on okra where Rhizobia used as seed dressing and soil drenching significantly increased growth parameters and infection of root rot fungi. Ehteshamul-Haque & Ghaffar (1993) reported that some strains of *Rhizobia* which fix atmospheric nitrogen in association with leguminous plants showed significant control of M. phaseolina, R. solani and Fusarium spp., infection on both leguminous plants like soybean and mung bean and non-leguminous plants like sunflower and okra.

The ability of *Rhizobia* to inhibit certain soil borne plant pathogens (Chakraborty & Purkayastha, 1984; Zaki & Ghaffar, 1987) has increased the importance of *Rhizobia* in addition to their use in nitrogen fixation. Present study showed that seed dressing was more effective in reduction of root rot fungi in mash bean plants than the soil drenching treatment. It was also previously observed that *B. thuringiensis* applied as seed dressing and soil drenching showed a significant increase in seed germination, shoot length, shoot weight, root length and root weight on mung bean and okra (Sheikh *et al.*, 2006). There is therefore need to characterize nematicidal and fungicidal compound (s) produced by biological antagonists in the control of root rot instead of use of pesticides, which are costly and hazardous.

Acknowledgment

We are grateful to HEC for providing financial support in order to carry out this research work.

References

Booth, C. 1971. *The genus Fusarium*. Commonwealth Mycological Institute, Kew Surrey, England, pp.237.

- Burkill, J.H. 1966. A dictionary of economic products of the Malay Peninsula. Art Printing works, Kuala Lumpur.2 vols.
- Chakraborty, U. and B.N. Purkayastha. 1984. Role of Rhizobiotoxin in protecting soybean roots from *Macrophomina phaseolina* infection. *Can, J. Microbiol.*, 30: 285-289.
- Dawar, S., F. Perveen and A. Dawar. 2005. Effect of different strains of *Rhizobium* spp., in the control of root infecting fungi and growth of crop plants. *Int. J. Biotech.*, 2: 415-418.
- Duke, J.A. and K.K. Wain. 1981. *Medicinal plants of the world*. Computer index wth more than 85,000 entries. 3 vols.
- Ehteshamul-Haque, S., A.Ghaffar and M.J. Zaki. 1990. Biological control of root rot diseases of okra, sunflower, soybean and mash bean. *Pak. J. Bot.*, 22: 121-124.
- Ehteshamul-Haque, S. and A.Ghaffar. 1993. Use of *Rhiozobia* in the control of root rot diseases of sunflower, okra, soy bean and mung bean. *J. Phytopathology*, 138: 157-163.

2164

BACTERIA ON RHIZOPHORA MUCRONATA IN THE CONTROL OF ROOT INFECTING FUNGI 2165

- Gomez, K.A. and A.A. Gomez. 1984. *Statistical procedures for Agricultural Research* 2nd ed. Willey, New York, pp. 680.
- Gray, E.J., K.D. Lee, A.M. Souleimanov, M.R.D. Falco, X. Zhou, A.LY. T.C. Charles., B.T. Driscoll and D. L. Smith. 2006. A novel bacteriocin, thuricin 17, produced by plant growth promoting rhizobacteria strain Bt NEB17: isolation and classification. J. Applied Microbiology, 100(3): 545-554.
- Hafeez, A. 1986. Plant diseases. Pakistan Agricultural Research Centre (PARC), Islamabad. pp 552.
- Hynes, M.F. and M.P. O' Connel. 1990. Host plant effect on competition among strains of *Rhizobium leguminosarum. Can. J. Microbiol.*, 36: 864-869.
- Keen, B.A. and H. Raczkowski. 1922. Clay contents and certain physical properties of soil. *J.Agric. Sci.*, 11: 441-449.
- Lumsden, R.D. and J.C. Locke. 1989. Biological control of *Pythium ultimatum* and *Rhizoctonia* solani damping off with *Gliocladium virens* in soilless mix. *Phytopathology*, 79: 361-366.
- Mackenzie, H.A. and H.S. Wallace. 1954. The Kjeldahl determination of nitrogen. A critical study of digestion conditions, temperature, catalyst and oxidizing agents. *Aust. J. Chem.*, 7: 55-70.
- Nash, S.M. and W.C. Snyder. 1962. Quantitative estimations by plate counts of propagules of the bean root rot *Fusarium* in field soils, *Phytopath.*, 52: 567-572.
- Parmeter, J.R. 1970. *Rhizoctonia solani biology and pathology*. Univ. of California Press, Berkeley Los Angeles and London. pp. 255.
- Saifullah, S.M. 1982. *Mangrove ecosystem of Pakistan*, In: The third Research on Mangroves in Middle East, Japan Cooperative Centre for the Middle East. Publ. No. 137. Tokyo, Japan. 69-80.
- Seuk. Bae, Yeoung, OK-Hee Choi, Kyung-Soek Park, Sang-Bum Lee and Choong-Hoe Kim. 2000. A useful method for functional analysis of plant growth promoting rhizobacteria in the development of cucumber root system. Plant pathology Division, National Institute of Agricultural Science and Technology, Suwon 441-707, Korea.
- Shahzad, S. and A. Ghaffar. 1992. Effect of different populations of *Paecilomyces lilacinus* on the biological control of *M. phaseolina* and *Meloidogyne incognita* infection on mung bean. *Expert consultation on plant Nematode Problems and their control in the Near East Region* (II nd international Meeting on plant Nematology, Karachi). p. 77.
- Sheikh, A.H. and A. Ghaffar. 1975. Population study of sclerotia of *Macrophomina phaseolina* in cotton field. *Pak. J. Bot.*, 7: 13-17.
- Sheikh, L.I., S. Dawar., M.J. Zaki and A. Ghaffar. 2006. Efficacy of *Bacillus thuringiensis* and *Rhizobium meliloti* with nursery fertilizers in the control of root infecting fungi on mung bean and okra plants. *Pak. J. Bot.*, 38(2): 465-473.
- Siddiqui, I.A., S. Ehteshamul-Haque and A. Ghaffar. 1998a. Effect of fungicides on the efficacy of *Rhizobium meliloti* and *Bradyrhizobium* sp., in the control of root infecting fungi on chickpea. *Pak. J. Bot.*, 30: 69-74.
- Siddiqui, I.A., S. Ehteshamul-Haque and A Ghaffar. 1998b. Effect of Rhizobia and fungal antagonists in the control of root infecting fungi on sunflower and chickpea. *Pak. J. Bot.*, 30: 279-286.
- Siddiqui, I.A., S.A. Qureshi, V. Sultana, S. Ehteshamul-Haque and A. Ghaffar. 2000. Biological control of root rot and root knot disease complex of tomato. *Plant and Soil*, 227: 163-169.
- Sinclair, J.B. 1982. Compendium of soybean diseases, 2nd ed. American Phytopathological society, pp.104.
- Waksmans, S.A. and E.B. Fred. 1992. A tentative outline of plates method for determining the number of microorganisms in soil. *Soil Sci.*, 14: 27-28.
- Wilhem, S. 1955. Longevity of the *Verticillium* with fungus in the laboratory and field *Phytopathology*, 45: 180-181.
- Zaki, M.J. and A. Ghaffar. 1987. Effect of *Rhizobium* spp., on *Macrophomina phaseolina*. *Pak. J. Sci. Ind. Res.*, 30: 305-306.

(Received for publication 10 March 2007)